Hamilton County Clerk of Courts

www.courtclerk.org

APPEARANCE DOCKET

Case Number: A 0405974

Attorney - Plaintiff BARBARA BISON JACOBSON

14190

Attorney - Defendant

Judge -

DAVID P DAVIS

44

NATIONWIDE BIWEEKLY ADMINISTRATION INC vs. BELO CORP

Filed: 7/28/2004

C366 - OTHER TORT & JURY DEMAND

Total Deposits \$475.00 CR

Total Costs \$139.00

NATIONWIDE BIWEEKLY ADMINISTRATION INC

Plaintiff(s)

vs.

BELO CORP SCOTT BURNS

Defendant(s)

IMAGE	DATE	DESCRIPTION	AMOUNT
Doc	7/28/2004	COMPLAINT & JURY DEMAND FILED	
Doc	7/28/2004	CLASSIFICATION FORM FILED.	
	7/29/2004	TAXED IN COSTS - FILING BARBARA BISON JACOBSON	0.00
	7/29/2004	DO NOT SERVE PER ATTY	
	7/29/2004	ISSUE DESK - DEPOSIT BY VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR & PEASE	475.00-
	8/4/2004	JUDGE ASSIGNED CASE ROLLED TO MYERS/BETH/A PRIMARY	
Doc	6/15/2005	WRITTEN REQUEST FOR CERTIFIED MAIL SERVICE OF SUMMONS AND COMPLAINT ON SCOTT BURNS	
Doc	6/15/2005	WRITTEN REQUEST FOR CERTIFIED MAIL SERVICE OF SUMMONS AND COMPLAINT ON BELO CORPORATION	
Doc	6/16/2005	SUMMONS ISSUED BY CERTIFIED MAIL TO BELO CORP	
Doc	6/16/2005	SUMMONS ISSUED BY CERTIFIED MAIL TO SCOTT BURNS	
	6/16/2005	CERTIFIED MAIL SERVICE ISSUED TO SCOTT	

CaSeste 0506+00048000AS Do Durocente 1+121-2 File de 017/01781/2012/0505 Pargação 01 o 1919

		BURNS
	6/17/2005	CERTIFIED MAIL SERVICE ISSUED TO BELO CORP
Doc	6/24/2005	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE
Doc	6/24/2005	POSTAL RECEIPT RETURNED, COPY OF SUMMONS AND COMPLAINT DELIVERED TO SCOTT BURNS ON 06/21/05, FILED
Doc	6/24/2005	POSTAL RECEIPT RETURNED, COPY OF SUMMONS AND COMPLAINT DELIVERED TO BELO CORP ON 06/21/05, FILED
Doc	6/24/2005	POSTAL RECEIPT RETURNED, COPY OF SUMMONS AND COMPLAINT DELIVERED TO BELO CORP ON 06/21/05, FILED
252	6/27/2005	ENTRY OF DISQUALIFICATION
	6/30/2005	JUDGE REASSIGNED CASE TRANSFERRED FROM MYERS/BETH/A DISQUALIFICATION PRIMARY
	6/30/2005	JUDGE ASSIGNED CASE ROLLED TO DAVIS/DAVID/P PRIMARY

Last Updated: July 17, 2005 © 2005 Greg Hartmann, Hamilton County Clerk of Courts. All rights reserved.

IN THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS HAMILTON COUNTY, OHIO

FILED

NAMES OF STREET	A0405207 AUL 281 P 8:57
NATIONWIDE BI-WEEKLY	: Case No.
ADMINISTRATION, INC.,	CLERK OF COURTS
1410 Dayton-Xenia Road	: HAMILTON COUNTX OHIO
Xenia, Ohio 45385,	: Judge:
Plaintiff, vs.	COMPLAINT FOR DAMAGES DO Not Serve WITH JURY DEMAND BY BARGARA PISON TALORS OF
	By: PANBARA PERA MOUNT
BELO CORP. c/o Robert W. Decherd, Chairman, President and Chief Executive Officer	Date: 7/29/04
P.O. Box 655237	RIG, COMP, PARTIES, SUMMONS
Dallas Texas, 75265-5237	() CERT MAIL () SHERIFF () WAVE
and	() PROCESS SERVER () NONE CLERKS FEESTIC
Scott Burns	SECURITY FOR COST
P.O. Box 655237	DEPOSITED BY 14190
Dallas Texas, 75265-5237,	FILING CODE C366
Defendants.	:

Plaintiff Nationwide Bi-Weekly Administration, Inc., (hereafter referred to as "Nationwide") for its Complaint against Defendants states as follows:

NATURE OF THE ACTION

This is an action for defamation, commercial disparagement, and tortious interference with prospective business relations arising out of publication on the internet of a newspaper article that falsely labels plaintiffs' marketing materials as "deceptive," falsely misstates the content of plaintiffs' marketing letter, and falsely describes an alleged discrepancy in calculations, to incorrectly conclude that consumers cannot achieve the results advertised by plaintiffs.

D60047772

PARTIES

- 2. Plaintiffs Nationwide Bi-Weekly Administration, Inc. and Nationwide Mortgage Protection, Inc. are corporations organized under the laws of the State of Ohio whose principal place of business is in Xenia, Ohio.
- Defendant Belo Corp. is a Delaware corporation with its principal place of business in Dallas, Texas, which owns various newspaper and television properties, publishes the *Dallas Morning News*, and maintains a web site through which the false and defamatory article about Nationwide is published and continuously made available throughout the State of Ohio and elsewhere.
- 4. Defendant Scott Burns is an employee of the Dallas Morning News and is identified as the author of the false and defamatory article about Nationwide.

FACTS

- 5. Nationwide provides a bi-weekly mortgage payment service to borrowers, administering the payment on a bi-weekly basis of loans that are due monthly, with the effect of saving interest and retiring the loan earlier.
- 6. Nationwide sends a copyrighted marketing letter to new borrowers, explaining the service and setting forth a sample comparison of the results with monthly payment, compared to bi-weekly payment, on a \$110,000, 30-year mortgage at 8%.
- 7. Defendants published an article (the "Article") dated July 29, 2003, in the Dallas Morning News, and are continuously re-publishing it on a web site of defendant Belo Corp., which displays the Article whenever Nationwide's name is entered in an internet search engine.

- 8. The Article is headlined with the following two lines: "You're 'entitled' to deception" and "Sales pitch for biweekly mortgage payment plan doesn't tell whole story."
- 9. The Article characterizes the offer made in Nationwide's marketing letter as "deceptive" by purporting to expose facts that are disclosed in the marketing letter itself, including the facts that Nationwide identifies new loans through public records, and that a homeowner could pre-pay a mortgage without using an administrative service.
- 10. The Article incorrectly states that the "sample mortgage" used as an illustration in Nationwide's marketing letter fails to disclose an interest rate, whereas the description of the sample mortgage plainly states that it is based on a 30-year mortgage at 8%.
- 11. The Article incorrectly states an alleged interest rate assumption for the "sample mortgage" in Nationwide's marketing letter, and falsely states that no loans at the rate used in the sample have been made in about 15 years.
- 12. Based on its misreading of the assumptions in the "sample mortgage," the Article defames Nationwide and falsely disparages its services and marketing letter by stating that consumers "won't get the results they claim."

FIRST CLAIM FOR RELIEF

(Defamation)

13. The statements made in the Article defame Nationwide and injure its business reputation.

- 14. Defendants published the defamatory statements in the Article without privilege, with actual knowledge that they were false or with reckless disregard as to their truth or falsity, or negligently.
- 15. Nationwide has been injured in its business reputation and adversely affected in its business by defendants' statements falsely accusing Nationwide of deceptive practices and thereby impugning its integrity.

SECOND CLAIM FOR RELIEF

(Business Disparagement)

- 16. The statements made in the Article demean the quality and value of the services provided by Nationwide.
- 17. The Article falsely characterizes Nationwide's offer of services as "deception," misrepresents the disclosures provided by Nationwide, incorrectly reports the facts concerning the "sample mortgage"
- 18. Defendants have committed a deceptive trade practice in the course of their business by disparaging plaintiffs' services by false representations of fact.

THIRD CLAIM FOR RELIEF

(Tortious Interference with Prospective Business Relations)

- 19. On information and belief, prospective customers of Nationwide have seen the false statements contained in the Article and have, as a result of the intentional and improper statements of defendants, declined to do business with Nationwide.
- 20. On information and belief, defendants have by virtue of the widespread publication of the Article via the internet, intentionally, or with reckless disregard that is

tantamount to intent, and improperly interfered with Nationwide's prospective business relations.

21. On information and belief, Nationwide has suffered a loss of earnings and profits as a result of defendants' interference with its prospective business relations.

WHEREFORE, plaintiffs pray for judgment against defendants as follows:

- A. For damages in an amount to be proven at trial, exceeding \$25,000;
- B. For punitive damages in an amount to be proven at trial, exceeding \$25,000;
- C. For the costs of this action together with plaintiffs' attorney fees;

D. For such other and further relief as the Court may deem just.

Respectfully submitted,

Barbara Bison Jacobson (0014190) Worys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

221 East Fourth Street, Suite 2000

P.O. Box 236

Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Telephone: 513-723-4016 Facsimile: 513-852-8481

Trial Attorney for Plaintiff

JURY DEMAND

Plaintiffs hereby request a trial by jury of their peers of the maximum number of

jurors allowed herein.

Barbara Bison (acobson (00/14/90)

NOTIFICATION FORM

HAMILTON COUNTY, OHIO	Clerk of Courts
	Docket Code: FNFF
CASE INFORMATION	• .
Date: 28 20 CH -	
Case No.: A0405974	
Caption: NATION DIDE BUDGELL VS BE	clo Copposet AL
coministration. Inc. 5	

	\sim
ATTORNEY INFORMATION	
Attorney Name: BARBARA BISM JACASSA	
Attorney Address: 100,5 States Seymous 4	
Street no.	
CINCIDNATION 4520	
Ohio Attorney Supreme Court No.: 0014190	
() Address change only	

COURT PARTY INFORMATION	
Name of Glient MATION WINE BUDGELY JON	☑10.
Name of Clients Off	() Plaintiff () Defendant
Name of Clients Are	() Plaintiff () Defendant
Name of Client	_ () Plaintiff () Defendant
Name of Client Hell &	() Plaintiff () Defendant
HIAIR AR	_ () Plaintiff () Defendant
Name of Client:	() Plaintiff () Defendant
Name of Client:	
Name of Client:	() Plaintiff () Defendant
Substituted for:	(if applicable)



COURT OF COMMON PLEAS HAMILTON COUNTY, OHIO

CLASSIFICATION FORM (REV 6-12-00) WWW.COURTCLERK.ORG

JAMES CISSELL CLERK OF COURTS

10100	
CASE NUMBER: AU405974 PLA	INTIFF: NATIONWICE BI-Weekly ADMINISHEATION. INC.
PURSUANT TO SUPERINTENDENCE RULE	4, THIS CASE WAS ORIGINALLY FILED AND DISMISSED
UNDER CASE NUMBER:	BY JUDGE
PLEASE INDICATE CLASSIFICATIO	ON INTO WHICH THIS CASE FALLS:
OTHER TORT - C360 () Personal Injury - C310 () Wrongful Death - C320 () Vehicle Accident - C370 () PROFESSIONAL TORT - A300 () Personal Injury - A310 () Wrongful Death - A320 () Legal Malpractice - A330 () Medical Malpractice - A340 () PRODUCT LIABILITY - B350 () Personal Injury - B310 () Wrongful Death - B320 WORKER'S COMPENSATION () Nose Compliant Employer - D410 () Appeal - D420 FORECLOSURE () Foreclosure - E510 () Foreclosure-Taxes - E520 () Foreclosure-Mechanics Lien - E530 () ADMINISTRATIVE APPEALS - F600 () Appeal Civil Service - F610 () Appeal Motor Vehicle - F620 () Appeal Unemployment - F630 () Appeal Liquor - F640 () Appeal Taxes - F650 () Appeal Taxes - F650 () Appeal Zoning - F660	() OTHER CIVIL – H700-34
	100047768:
DATE: 7-28.04 ATT	ORNEY (PRINT): BARBARA BISHO JUCIBSHO
ОНІС	OSUPREME COURT NUMBER:

Word/S/ClassificationForm



COMMON PLEAS COURT HAMILTON COUNTY, OHIO

FILED

2005 JUN 15 A 11: 08

COLOGIES HARTMANN CLERK OF COURTS HAM (NIY OH

Nationwide Bi-Weekly		
Administration, Inc	CASE NO. A0405974	
vs	WRITTEN REQUEST FOR SERVICE TYPE OF PAPERS TO BE SERVED ARE	
Belo Corp. and Scott Burns	Complaint	
	(a) PLEASE CHECK IF THIS IS A DOMESTIC CASE	
PLAINTIFF/DEFENDANT REQUESTS	EXPRESS MAIL SERVICE	
CERTIFIED MAIL SERVICE X	REGULAR MAIL SERVICE	
PERSONAL SERVICE	RESIDENCE SERVICE FOREIGN SHERIFF	
PROCESS SERVICE		
on Belo Corporation		
c/o Robert W Decherd		
President and Chief Executive	Officer	
P O. Box 655237		
Dallas, TX 75265		
Barbara Bison Jacobson	513-723-4016	
ATTORNEY	PHONE NUMBER 0014190	
221 E. 4th Street, Suite 2000 ADDRESS	ATTORNEY NUMBER	





COMMON PLEAS COURT HAMILTON COUNTY, OHIO

FILED

7005 JUN 15 A 11:07

GREGOR (HARTMANN CLERK OF COURTS HAM CNTY OH

Nationwide Bi-Weekly	HAM CHTY OH		
Administration, Inc	CASE NO. A0405974		
vs	WRITTEN REQUEST FOR SERVICE TYPE OF PAPERS TO BE SERVED ARE		
Belo Corp. and Scott Burns	Complaint		
	(a) PLEASE CHECK IF THIS IS A DOMESTIC CASE		
PLAINTIFF/DEFENDANT REQUESTS.	EXPRESS MAIL SERVICE		
CERTIFIED MAIL SERVICE X	REGULAR MAIL SERVICE		
PERSONAL SERVICE	RESIDENCE SERVICE		
PROCESS SERVICE	FOREIGN SHERIFF		
ON Scott Burns	•		
P.O. Box 655237			
Dallas, TX 75265			
Barbara Bison Jacobson	513-723-4016		
ATTORNEY	PHONE NUMBER		
221 E 4th Street, Suite 2000 ADDRESS	0014190 ATTORNEY NUMBER		



COURT OF COMMON PLEAS HAMILION COUNTY, OHIO

NATIONWIDE BIWEEKLY ADMINISTRA

PLAINTIFF

Use below number on all future pleadings

-- vs --

No. A 0405974 summons

BELO CORP

DEFENDANT

BELO CORP %ROBERT W DECHERD CHAIRMAN PRES CEO D-1 P O BOX 655237 DALLAS TX 75265

You are notified that you have been named Defendant(s) in a complaint filed by

NATIONWIDE BIWEEKLY ADMINISTRA 1410 DAYION XENIA PD XENIA OH 45385

Plaintiff(s)

in the Hamilton County, COMMON PLEAS CIVIL Division, GREGORY HARTMANN, 1000 MAIN STREET ROOM 315, CINCINNATI, OH 45202.

You are hereby summoned and required to serve upon the plaintiff's attorney, or upon the plaintiff, if he/she has no attorney of record, a copy of an answer to the complaint within twenty-eight (28) days after service of this summons on you, exclusive of the day of service. Your answer must be filed with the Court within three (3) days after the service of a copy of the answer on the plaintiff's attorney.

Further, pursuant to Local Rule 19 of Hamilton County, you are also required to file a Notification Form to receive notice of all future hearings.

If you fail to appear and defend, judgement by default will be rendered against you for the relief demanded in the attached complaint.

45202

Name and Address of attorney BARBARA BISON JACOBSON SUITE 2000 PO BOX 236 221 EAST FOURTH STREET CINCINNATI OH GREGORY HARTMANN Clerk, Court of Common Pleas Hamilton County, Ohio

By CARL E PIECZONKA

Deputy

Date: Jume 16, 2005

D64135463

COURT OF COMMON PLEAS HAMILTON COUNTY, OHIO

NATIONWIDE BIWEEKLY ADMINISTRA

PLAINTIFF

Use below number on all future pleadings

-- vs --

No. A 0405974 SUMMONS

BELO CORP

DEFENDANT

SCOTT BURNS P O BOX 655237 DALLAS TX 75265

D-2

You are notified that you have been named Defendant(s) in a complaint filed by

NATIONWIDE BIWEEKLY ADMINISTRA 1410 DAYION XENIA RD XENIA OH 45385

Plaintiff(s)

in the Hamilton County, COMMON PLEAS CIVIL Division, GREGORY HARTMANN, 1000 MAIN STREET ROOM 315, CINCINNATI, OH 45202.

You are hereby summoned and required to serve upon the plaintiff's attorney, or upon the plaintiff, if he/she has no attorney of record, a copy of an answer to the complaint within twenty-eight (28) days after service of this summons on you, exclusive of the day of service. Your answer must be filed with the Court within three (3) days after the service of a copy of the answer on the plaintiff's attorney.

Further, pursuant to Local Rule 10 of Bamilton County, you are also required to file a Notification Form to receive notice of all future hearings.

If you fail to appear and defend, judgement by default will be rendered against you for the relief demanded in the attached complaint.

45202

Name and Address of attorney
BARBARA EISON JACOBSON
SUITE 2000 PO BOX 236
221 EAST FOURTH STREET
CINCINNATI OH

GREGORY HARTMANN Clerk, Court of Common Pleas Hamilton County, Ohio

By CARL E PIECZONKA

Deputy

Date: June 16, 2005

D64135435



FILED

2005 JUN 24 P 2: 36

LEER OF COURTS
HAVE CHTY. OH

GREGORY HARTMANN CLERK OF COURTS 1000 MAIN STREET RM 115 CINCINNATI OH 45202-1288

Common Pleas Civil

CERTIFIED MAIL

7194 5168 6310 0219 7211

RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED
Article Addressed To:

06/17/2005 SUMMONS & COMPLAINT A 0405974 D1 BELO CORP %ROBERT W DECHERD CHAIRMAN PRES (P O BOX 655237

DALLAS TX 75265

A. Stonature: (Addressee of Agent)

A. Stonature: (Addressee of Agent)

B. Received By: (Please Print Clearly)

THO MA J MAKJMI

C. Date of Delivery JUN 2 1 2005

D. Addressee's Address (If Delivers From Address Used by Sender)

Sacondary Address / Buile / Apt / Floor (Please Print Clearly)

Delivery Address

City State ZIP + 4 Code

FILED

2005 JUN 24 P 2: 36

CLEMI COURTS
ELVI COUY OH



GREGORY HARTMANN CLERK OF COURTS 1000 MAIN STREET RM 115 CINCINNATI OH 45202-1288

Common Pleas Civil
ATENNED (TO NOMOTO GITH EVENIMOS)
A. Signature: (Addressee or Agent)
X Sharms Marshay
B. Received By: (Please Print Clearly)
THOMAS MARShay
C. Date of Delivery JUN 2 1 2005
2014 5 7 5003
D. Addresses's Address (it Offerent From Address Used by Sender)
Secondary Address / Sute / Apt / Floor (Please Print Clearly)
Delivery Address
City State ZIP + 4 Code

CERTIFIED MAIL



7144 27P9 01E9 8915 4511

RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

Article Addressed To:

Form 3800, 5102

06/16/2005 SUMMONS & COMPLAINT
A 0405974 D1
BELO CORP
ROBERT W DECHERD CHAIRMAN PRES I
P O BOX 655237
DALLAS TX 75265

FILED

2005 JUN 24 P 2: 36

CLEAN FOURTS
HAN CHI'Y OH



GREGORY HARTMANN CLERK OF COURTS 1000 MAIN STREET RM 115 CINCINNATI OH 45202-1288

PS Form 3800,6402 Common Pleas Civil COMPLETE: INISASECTION ONEDELIVERY A. Signature (D. Addressee of D. Agent) B. Received By: (Please Print Clearly) THOMAS manghi C. Date of Delivery D. Addresses's Address of Deferent From Acc Secondary Address ! Suite | Apt. | Floor | (Please Print Clearly Delivery Address 2iP + 4 Code State

CERTIFIED MAIL



7194 5168 6310 0219 7228

RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

06/16/2005 SUMMONS & COMPLAINT A 0405974 D2 **SCOTT BURNS** P O BOX 655237 DALLAS TX 75265

COURT OF COMMON PLEAS HAMILTON COUNTY, OHIO

FILED

2005 JUN 24 A 11: 16

NATIONWIDE BIWEEKLY ADMINISTRATION, INC.,

٧.

Plaintiff,

Case No.: A 0405974 .: This Elity of

Judge Beth A. Myers

NOTICE OF APPEARANCE

BELO CORP.

and

SCOTT BURNS,

Defendants.

Please take notice that Richard M. Goehler and Monica L. Dias of Frost Brown Todd LLC, 2200 PNC Center, 201 East Fifth Street, Cincinnati, Ohio 45202-4182, hereby respectfully submit their notice of appearance as lead trial attorneys on behalf of Defendants The Dallas Morning News, L.P., (improperly named in the Complaint as "Belo Corp") and Scott Burns in this matter.

OF COUNSEL:

FROST BROWN TODD LLC 2200 PNC Center 201 East Fifth Street Cincinnati, Ohio 45202-4182 (513) 651-6800 (513) 651-6981 (Facsimile)

Respectfully submitted,

Richard M. Goehler (0009160)

Monica L. Dias (0073617)

Trial Attorneys for Defendants The Dallas Morning News, LP and Scott Burns

FROST BROWN TODD LLC

2200 PNC Center

201 East Fifth Street

Cincinnati, Ohio 45202-4182

(513) 651-6800

(513) 651-6981 (Facsimile)

E-mail: rgoehler@fbtlaw.com mdias@fbtlaw.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing Notice of Appearance has been served upon Barbara Bison Jacobson, Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP, 221 East Fourth Street, Suite 2000, P.O. Box 236, Cincinnati, Ohio 45202-2409, by regular U.S. mail, postage prepaid, this 24th day of June, 2005.

Maria Dias

CinLibrary 1518829v I

COURT OF COMMON PLEAS HAMILTON COUNTY, OHIO



NATIONWIDE BIWEEKLY,

Case No. A 0405974

Plaintiff,

Judge Beth A. Mycrs

VS.

ENTRY OF DISQUALIFICATION

BELO CORPORATION,

Defendant.

Pursuant to the provisions of Rule 7(E) of the Local Rules of Practice, the undersigned hereby disqualifies herself from the above-captioned case for the following reason. Defendants, Belo Corporation and Scott Burns, are represented by her former law firm

ENTER

JUN 2 7 2005

BETH A. MYERS, JUDGE